



Pierce County Mental Health Services

SALARY SURVEY REPORT

for

Performance Audit Committee

Pierce County Council

April 28, 2006

Presented May 11, 2006

SUBMITTED BY
JM MANAGEMENT CONSULTING
4021 BERRENDO DRIVE
SACRAMENTO, CA 95864
(916) 487-0258
JCTMAH@YAHOO.COM

Table of Contents

Transmittal Letter	2
Executive Summary	3
I. Background.....	4
II. Study Objective	5
III. Study Methodology	5
IV. Findings & Analysis	9
Appendix 1 Comments by Pierce County Human Services.....	14
Appendix 2 Consultant Comments	17

JM MANAGEMENT CONSULTING
4021 Berrendo Drive
Sacramento, CA 95864

(916) 487-0258
jcmah@yahoo.com

April 28, 2006

Mr. Matt Temmel
Performance Audit Coordinator
955 Tacoma Avenue South, Suite 302A
Tacoma, WA 98402

Dear Mr. Temmel,

On behalf of JM Management Consulting, I am pleased to provide you with the final "Salary Survey Report" on Pierce County Mental Health Services.

The purpose of this project was to conduct a base salary comparison for the identified benchmarked classifications to appropriate local market agencies. Prior to presentation of the final report to the Performance Audit Committee, draft reports were submitted for internal review to your office and to Ms. Fran Lewis, Human Services Director. Appropriate comments and suggestions were incorporated into the final report. Comments from Human Services are listed under Appendix 1, and the consultant response is under Appendix 2.

As Project Manager, I am extremely pleased with the collaboration our team members experienced on this project. JM Management Consulting wishes to express our sincere thanks to the Pierce County officials and staff members who assisted with the project. We recognize that this project with its short notice can be disruptive for the survey respondents involved providing data, and we appreciate the participants sharing their time and information.

If you should have any questions, please contact me at (916) 487-0258. Thank you for the opportunity to partner with you and other key stakeholders on this project.

Best Regards,



Jenny C. Mah
Project Manager
JM Management Consulting

Executive Summary

Mental health clients receive a number of “direct services” delivered by employees of the Pierce County Department of Human Services. The objective of this salary survey is to compare Pierce County base salaries in benchmarked job classifications that provide mental health direct services with base salaries for comparable positions in public and private organizations in the local labor market.

The salary survey was undertaken as part of a performance audit objective which asks whether it is more efficient and cost effective for the Regional Support Network to provide direct services or to contract for services. This study begins to address that issue by reporting on base salaries. However, the study does not address other kinds of costs, staffing needs, facility issues, performance, and other matters relevant to the debate about direct services and contract services. By providing comparable information on salaries, it is hoped that this study will provide a foundation or starting point for others to address the remaining questions.

Participating in the survey were 13 other employers in the local labor market, defined as including Pierce County, King County, Thurston County, and Kitsap County. The survey response rate was 100%.

The survey data refers to eight Pierce County benchmarked job classifications used for 63 employee positions. The 63 positions represent just over half of the 123 Pierce County positions that provide direct services to mental health clients.

The survey data was limited to base compensation (hourly rate of pay). It does not include supplemental pay, benefits, or other detailed information.

The findings of the salary survey, briefly stated, are:

1. Pierce County minimum salaries (lowest step on the salary scale) in each benchmarked class are all higher than the averages and medians in the survey data.
2. Pierce County maximum salaries (highest step on the scale) are generally higher than in the surveyed agencies, although the rates for Nurse Practitioners (ARNP) are a little lower than the market.
3. Pierce County average actual salaries are generally higher than the average and median survey data in the non-nursing classifications, while the average actual salaries for Licensed Practical Nurses (LPN) and Nurse Practitioners (ARNP) are lower than the market.

The data on average actual salaries is affected by high vacancy rates in Pierce County at the time of the survey and by the method of calculating average salaries for the positions in the benchmarked classifications. In general, because of the vacancies, the survey data on minimum and maximum salaries may be more useful than the data on actual salaries.

Comments by Pierce County Human Services appear in Appendix 1. Consultant comments are in Appendix 2.

I. Background

This study is part of a performance audit mandated by Ordinance No. 2006-17, which took effect on March 7, 2006. Among other things, the ordinance directed the Performance Audit Committee to conduct a performance audit of Puget Sound Behavioral Health and the Pierce County Regional Support Network (RSN) and report back to the County Council with a final report and recommendations by April 30, 2006.

Two contractors, working with Pierce County performance audit staff, have conducted performance audit work:

- ⇒ MCPP Healthcare Consulting, in a separate report, analyzes crisis and inpatient services as well as funding distribution within the Regional Support Network.
- ⇒ JM Management Consulting conducted this salary survey as part of an audit objective that asks whether it is more efficient and cost effective for the RSN to provide direct services or to contract for services.

The Mental Health Division of the Pierce County Department of Human Services operates as the Pierce County Regional Support Network under a contract with the State of Washington. With revenue from the state and other sources, the RSN has an annual budget of approximately \$52 million. The general pattern of service delivery is that private non-profit agencies provide residential, outpatient, and support services under contract with the RSN, while Pierce County employees provide crisis and inpatient services.

The five “direct services” provided by county employees are as follows:

1. Mobile Outreach/Crisis Team – Involuntary commitment evaluations.
2. Crisis Triage – Short-term crisis intervention services (up to 72 hours).
3. Puget Sound Behavioral Health – Inpatient mental health services (voluntary and involuntary). Pierce County purchased PSBH out of bankruptcy in 2000 and operated it as a mental hospital until the state closed it for licensing violations in January 2006. It is scheduled to re-open as an Evaluation and Treatment Center.
4. Secure Detox – Involuntary commitment for drug and alcohol problems. Program started in March 2006 with state grant funding.
5. Jail Mental Health – Evaluation, stabilization, and diversion services for jail inmates.

Private non-profit agencies used to provide some, not all, of the above services. Mental health services were reorganized between 2000 and 2002 so that crisis and inpatient services are now available at a central location and are delivered by county employees.

As of late April 2006, Pierce County has approximately 123 employee positions to provide the above “direct services.” Approximately 90 positions are filled and 33 are vacant.

The present study begins to address the efficiency and effectiveness of direct services by comparing salaries of Pierce County employees who provide the direct services with salaries of other employees in the local labor market who provide comparable services.

However, this study does not address other kinds of costs, staffing needs, facility issues, performance, and other matters relevant to the debate about direct services and contract services. By providing comparable salary data, however, it is hoped that this study will provide a foundation or starting point for others to address the remaining questions.

II. Study Objective

The report objective is to compare Pierce County salaries in benchmarked job classifications that provide mental health “direct services” with salaries for comparable positions in public and private organizations in the local labor market.

III. Study Methodology

A. Project Planning

During the planning phase of the project, the consulting team reviewed background materials such as organizational charts, ordinances, and classification documents. The main tasks were to identify job classifications of the employees who provide direct services, select benchmark classifications for the survey, and select other organizations to be surveyed. The primary consultant, Jenny Mah, previously worked on Pierce County projects.¹ This experience greatly reduced the learning curve on this project and made it possible to complete the salary survey in approximately six weeks.

The consultant team conducted on-site planning interviews with the project manager, department representatives, and Human Resources staff, as follows:

- Matt Temmel, Performance Audit Coordinator and project manager
- Eric Hendrickson, Assistant Director, Human Resources
- Kathie Lybecker, HR Analyst
- Joe Carrillo, Labor Relations Manager
- Fran Lewis, Human Services Director

B. Survey Sources

The survey was designed to compare Pierce County salaries with others in the local labor market, defined as including Pierce County, King County, Thurston County, and Kitsap County. **Table 1** lists the 13 organizations that were surveyed. The survey response rate was 100%, that is, each of the 13 surveyed organizations responded to our request by providing salary data.

¹ The first project was a classification and compensation study by CPS Human Resources Services in 2002 and 2003 (report, February 2004). The second project, which started in 2005 and will be concluded by June this year, addresses salary and classification issues in the Pierce County Prosecuting Attorney’s Office and the Pierce County Department of Assigned Counsel.

Table 1: Survey Sources

	Organization	Location	County	Status	Union	Non-Union	Mental Health Services
	Pierce County Human Services, Mental Health Division	Tacoma	Pierce	County government	X	X	County employees provide crisis, inpatient, and other services. See list of “direct services,” p. 1 above.
1	Comprehensive Mental Health	Tacoma	Pierce	Private non-profit		X	Residential & outpatient services (contract with Pierce RSN)
2	Good Samaritan Behavioral Healthcare	Puyallup	Pierce	Private non-profit		X	Residential & outpatient services (contract with Pierce RSN)
3	Greater Lakes Mental Healthcare	Lakewood	Pierce	Private non-profit		X	Residential & outpatient services (contract with Pierce RSN)
4	Franciscan Healthcare (St. Joseph’s Hospital)	Tacoma	Pierce	Private non-profit hospital	X		Inpatient services
5	Western State Hospital	Lakewood	Pierce	State hospital	X		Inpatient
6	West Seattle Psychiatric Hospital	West Seattle	King	Private non-profit E&T	X		Inpatient (contract with King RSN)
7	Highline Mental Health Center	Highline	King	Private non-profit		X	Outpatient
8	Seattle Mental Health	Seattle	King	Private non-profit		X	Outpatient
9	Harborview Medical Center	Seattle	King	Public hospital	X	X	Crisis, inpatient, and outpatient services (contract with King RSN)
10	King County	Seattle	King	County government	X		County employees include (1) CDMHPs who do involuntary treatment, and (2) Jail mental health staff
11	Kitsap Mental Health Services	Bremerton	Kitsap	Private non-profit	X	X	Involuntary treatment and E&T (contract with Peninsula RSN)
12	Behavioral Health Resources	Olympia	Thurston	Private non-profit	X		Involuntary treatment and E&T (contract with Thurston-Mason RSN)
13	Providence St. Peter Hospital	Olympia	Thurston	Private non-profit hospital	X	X	Inpatient and outpatient

C. Benchmark Job Classes

The consultant team selected the benchmark classes with the help of Pierce County staff. Selection criteria included proportionate representation of heavily populated classes, availability of occupational matches among outside employers, and prevalence in providing direct services to Pierce County clients. **Table 2** lists the eight final benchmark classifications.²

Table 2: Pierce County Benchmark Job Classes

	Job Classification	Incumbents as of April 28	Vacancies as of April 28	Total Positions
1	Advanced Registered Nurse Practitioner (ARNP)	1	2	3
2	Behavior Health Specialist 3	10	4	14
3	Crisis Outreach Mental Health Professional	7	1	8
4	Direct Service Supervisor	7	1	8
5	Licensed Practical Nurse (LPN)	5	7.6	12.6
6	Mental Health Evaluation Specialist	5	0	5
7	Mental Health Therapist	3	1	4
8	Registered Nurse (RN)	8.4	0	8.4
	TOTAL	46.4	16.6	63
<i>Source: Data from Human Services Dept., April 12, 2006, updated April 14, 25, and 28, 2006.</i>				

The 63 positions in the benchmark classes represent just over half of the 123 Pierce County positions that provide direct services to mental health clients. Of the 63 positions, 16.6 positions (26%) were vacant on April 28, 2006.³

² Initially, 14 benchmark classifications were selected and included on the survey questionnaire, but six classifications were later dropped from the analysis, leaving a total of eight classifications that appear in Table 2. Of the initial 14 classifications, three produced an inadequate number of survey matches and were thus dropped (Certified Nursing Assistant, Physician Assistant, and Staff Physician). Three other classifications were dropped because of problems with the available Pierce County salary data (Clinical Coordinator, Staff Psychiatrist, and Staff Psychologist).

³ The vacancies created issues in how Pierce County actual average salaries should be computed. We used a “blended average,” as discussed below (p. 10, comment on Table 6).

D. Data Collection

Most of the salary survey data was collected by e-mail and telephone communications. However, to discuss data issues in detail, the consulting team held in-person meetings with Pierce County staff, including the Director of Human Services, Human Resource staff, and Performance Audit staff.

The survey agencies were provided with summary descriptions of the Pierce County job classes. For each Pierce County classification, the following data was requested from the survey sources:

1. Title of the classification that closely matches the Pierce County title
2. Incumbent status as Staff or Contractor
3. Salary plan minimum hourly rate
4. Salary plan maximum hourly rate
5. Actual hourly rate (average of positions)
6. Number of positions for each classification
7. Date of last salary increase
8. Union or non-union

The summary job descriptions were provided so that respondents could identify closely matched positions in their organizations. The respondents selected the matches, but the consultant team requested documentation from each responding organization, such as the job description, in order to validate the matches. All but one of the 13 survey respondents provided the requested documentation. With that exception, the job matches reported below are based on available documentation.⁴

The survey data includes base compensation (hourly rate of pay) of comparable positions in the surveyed organizations. The data does not include the following:

- Supplemental pay (overtime, bonus, on-call, shift differential, etc.)
- Mandatory benefits (FICA, retirement, etc.)
- Voluntary benefits (sick leave, vacation, insurance, cash pick ups, etc.)
- Total hours worked per week
- Full-time or part-time status
- Employee length of service.

While some compensation surveys request more detailed information on classifications and benefits, our request was simpler and less detailed. For example, rather than request individual salary data for each comparable position, the survey asked for the actual hourly rate as an average of the positions with that classification. The reason for this approach was heavily influenced by the short time available to conduct and complete the survey. The shorter the data request, it was assumed, the better were the chances of a good response.

⁴ The 13th agency provided the requested documentation after this report was written and transmitted for review to Human Services.

IV. Findings & Analysis

This report focuses on minimum salary rates, maximum salary rates, and average actual salaries in Pierce County and the other organizations. Shown below, in **Table 3**, are the definitions of terms used in reporting and analyzing the market survey results.

Table 3: Survey Definitions
<p>Pierce County Minimum Rate – This is the minimum hourly rate, or step 1, on the salary scale for the identified job classification.</p>
<p>Pierce County Maximum Rate – This is the maximum hourly rate, usually step 10, on the salary scale for the identified job classification.</p>
<p>Survey Results - Average (referring to minimum or maximum hourly rates). This is the average (mean) of the hourly rates for the identified classifications reported by the organizations that participated in the survey.</p>
<p>Survey Results – Median (referring to minimum or maximum hourly rates). This is the median (mid-point in the data) of the hourly rates reported by the responding organizations for the identified classifications.</p>
<p>% Pierce Higher or Lower – This column reports as a percentage Pierce County’s relative position to the survey sources. A positive number indicates that the Pierce County rates are higher than the local market. A negative number indicates lower-than-market rates.</p>
<p>Actual Salaries, Pierce Average – The average (mean) of actual hourly rates paid to all incumbents and budgeted for vacant positions in the identified class. The Pierce County average actual salary for each classification was calculated by combining the average of the incumbent salaries and a step 1 salary for each vacant position.</p>
<p>Actual Salaries, Survey Average – The respondents reported average rates for each class, rather than each individual rate. Thus the “survey average” is the average (mean) of the reported averages.</p>
<p>Actual Salaries, Survey Median – The respondents reported average rates for each class, rather than each individual rate. The “survey median” is the median (mid-point) of the reported averages.</p>

Tables 4, 5, and 6 appear on the following pages.

- ⇒ **Table 4** presents the reported minimum salaries for each classification, that is, the lowest rates on the salary scale.
- ⇒ **Table 5** presents the reported maximum rates, that is, the highest rates.
- ⇒ **Table 6** reports on actual salaries.

The surveyed organizations were asked to report the average hourly rate (minimum, maximum, and actual) of the positions in each classification. Thus the figures on “Survey Results” in tables 4, 5, and 6 are averages and medians of what was reported. Some highlights of the tables are as follows.

Minimum Salaries: Pierce County’s minimum salaries (lowest step on the salary scale) are all higher than the averages and medians for the surveyed agencies, as shown in **Table 4**. Pierce County is somewhat close to the market rates in the three nursing classifications: Advanced Registered Nurse Practitioner (ARNP), Registered Nurse (RN), and Licensed Practical Nurse (LPN). However, Pierce County is far above the market rates in the other five classifications.

Maximum Salaries: Pierce County’s maximum salaries (highest step on the scale) are generally higher than in the surveyed agencies, as shown in **Table 5**. There is a minor problem in the data: a few of the surveyed organizations do not have maximum rates. Nevertheless, putting aside this data issue, the Pierce County maximum rates are much higher than the market rates in five classifications and somewhat comparable to the market rates in the three nursing classes (ARNP, LPN, and RN).

Average Actual Salaries: Pierce County’s actual salaries are generally higher than the average and median rates in the non-nursing classifications, as shown in **Table 6**. However, the average actual salaries for Pierce County Licensed Practical Nurses (LPN) and Nurse Practitioners (ARNP) are lower than the market.

The Pierce County figures in Table 6 are averages for the positions in that classification, including the actual salary of each incumbent and salaries at the lowest step for the positions that are currently vacant. As of April 28, 2006, the vacancy rate for the positions was 26% (see Table 2, page 7.) Thus the Pierce County figures are a “blended average” of real and assumed data.

The consultants adopted the “blended average” approach as a way of dealing with the high number of vacancies that resulted after Puget Sound Behavioral Health was closed in January 2006. Another approach would be to give less weight to average actual salaries in the classifications that have a significant number of vacancies. In general, in our opinion, the survey data on minimum and maximum salaries may be more useful than the figures on actual salaries.

Table 4: Minimum Salaries Offered by Pierce County and the Surveyed Organizations

Classification Title	Number of Pierce County Positions	Pierce County Hourly Rate	Survey Responses		Survey Results		Survey Results	
			Number of Matches (a)	Number of Positions (b)	AVERAGE	% Pierce Higher or Lower	MEDIAN	% Pierce Higher or Lower
Advanced Registered Nurse Practitioner (ARNP)	3	\$35.50	10	72	\$34.17	4%	\$34.62	3%
Behavior Health Specialist 3	14	\$19.74	8	163	\$15.62	26%	\$15.15	30%
Crisis Outreach Mental Health Professional	8	\$26.43	5	47	\$18.28	45%	\$16.83	57%
Direct Service Supervisor	8	\$28.04	8	64	\$19.23	46%	\$18.05	55%
Licensed Practical Nurse (LPN)	13	\$16.41	10	317	\$15.16	8%	\$14.64	12%
Mental Health Evaluation Specialist	5	\$26.43	8	119	\$17.44	52%	\$15.91	66%
Mental Health Therapist	4	\$24.93	12	264	\$16.78	49%	\$16.69	49%
Registered Nurse (RN)	8	\$22.40	11	1,365	\$21.63	4%	\$21.93	2%
TOTAL	63	\$24.99		2,411	\$19.79	26%	\$19.23	30%

(a) The "number of matches" is the number of surveyed organizations that reported comparable positions for this classification.

(b) The "number of positions" is the total number of comparable positions reported by the surveyed organizations.

Table 5: Maximum Salaries Offered by Pierce County and the Surveyed Organizations

Classification Title	Number of Pierce County Positions	Pierce County Hourly Rate	Survey Responses		Survey Results		Survey Results	
			Number of Matches (a)	Number of Positions (b)	AVERAGE ©	% Pierce Higher or Lower	MEDIAN ©	% Pierce Higher or Lower
Advanced Registered Nurse Practitioner (ARNP)	3	\$45.97	10	72	\$49.99	-8%	\$51.22	-10%
Behavior Health Specialist 3	14	\$24.70	8	163	\$22.06	12%	\$21.04	17%
Crisis Outreach Mental Health Professional	8	\$33.76	5	47	\$26.60	27%	\$25.05	35%
Direct Service Supervisor	8	\$35.92	8	64	\$26.68	35%	\$26.17	37%
Licensed Practical Nurse (LPN)	13	\$22.02	10	317	\$21.26	4%	\$21.40	3%
Mental Health Evaluation Specialist	5	\$33.76	8	119	\$26.03	30%	\$23.34	45%
Mental Health Therapist	4	\$31.67	12	264	\$24.65	28%	\$23.61	34%
Registered Nurse (RN)	8	\$35.64	11	1,365	\$34.50	3%	\$36.18	-1%
TOTAL	63	\$32.93		2,411	\$28.97	14%	\$28.50	16%

(a) The "number of matches" is the number of surveyed organizations that reported comparable positions for this classification.

(b) The "number of positions" is the total number of comparable positions reported by the surveyed organizations.

© Some organizations do not have maximum rates for some classifications. Thus the averages and medians are based on fewer pieces of data than indicated in the column headed "Number of Matches."

Table 6: Actual Salaries (Averages and Medians) in Pierce County and Surveyed Organizations

Classification Title	Number of Pierce County Positions	Pierce County Average Hourly Rate	Survey Responses		Survey Results		Survey Results	
			Number of Matches (a)	Number of Positions (b)	AVERAGE	% Pierce Higher or Lower	MEDIAN	% Pierce Higher or Lower
Advanced Registered Nurse Practitioner (ARNP)	3	\$35.50	10	72	\$43.90	-19%	\$43.99	-19%
Behavior Health Specialist 3	14	\$22.18	8	163	\$18.76	18%	\$17.77	25%
Crisis Outreach Mental Health Professional	8	\$28.87	5	47	\$22.43	29%	\$21.01	37%
Direct Service Supervisor	8	\$32.75	8	64	\$24.53	34%	\$24.26	35%
Licensed Practical Nurse (LPN)	13	\$17.26	10	317	\$18.83	-8%	\$18.50	-7%
Mental Health Evaluation Specialist	5	\$32.46	8	119	\$21.72	49%	\$20.40	59%
Mental Health Therapist	4	\$28.88	12	264	\$20.91	38%	\$20.90	38%
Registered Nurse (RN)	8	\$33.68	11	1,365	\$30.08	12%	\$30.55	10%
TOTAL	63	\$28.95		2,411	\$25.15	15%	\$24.67	17%

(a) The "number of matches" is the number of surveyed organizations that reported comparable positions for this classification.

(b) The "number of positions" is the total number of comparable positions reported by the surveyed organizations.

Appendix 1

Comments by Pierce County Human Services

We have reviewed the content and conclusions of the report and believe that the methodology and peer group comparisons may provide an accurate representation of base rates paid to comparable classes of employees identified by the consultant. The set of factors we believe is missing could be characterized as “premium pay” and would include such items as hiring bonuses, shift differentials, standby pay, certification pay and preceptor pay. These “premiums” directly impact the hourly wages of employees and therefore, should be considered in and comparative data. These are important issues because Pierce County has made a decision to forgo payment of these premiums and instead put comparable increases into the base salary.

In addition to the premium pay, the private providers and other E&Ts contacted do not have maximum salaries for many of the professional classifications we surveyed. In the Pierce County system an employee reaches the top of the salary range in five years, if they were hired at the first step. If they were hired at an intermediate step, due to factors such as experience and/or education, they will reach the top of the range in less than five years. The private providers and other E&Ts do not have these same maximums.

We conducted a quick telephone survey of the peer facilities to determine whether they paid “premiums” such as shift differential, certification pay, standby pay, etc, with the following results:

Kitsap Mental Health Services

Nursing

Shift Differential:	\$ 2.00 Evening - per hour
	\$ 5.00 Night - per hour
	\$ 2.00 Weekend - per hour
	\$ 3.00 Charge nurse - per hour
Standby	\$75.00 per week

Counselors and CDMHP

Certification	6% Geriatric Specialist
	6% Child Specialist
Shift Differential	\$.75 Evening- per hour
	\$ 1.25 Night - per hour

Behavioral Health Resources

Nursing

Shift Differential	\$ 2.50 Evening - per hour
	\$ 3.50 Nights - per hour
	\$.75 Weekends - per hour

Counselors \$.75 Evenings - per hour
 \$ 1.25 Nights - per hour

MHP
 Standby \$ 1.00 per hour

Saint Peters Hospital -Olympia

Nursing
 Shift Differential \$ 2.50 Evening - per hour
 \$ 4.00 Night - per hour
 \$ 3.25 Weekends
 \$ 2.50 Charge Nurse - per hour

Standby \$ 4.00 per hour
 Certification \$ 1.00 per hour

Non-Union (Professional/Technical)
 Shift Differential \$ 1.50 Evening - per hour
 \$ 2.30 Night - per hour
 \$ 1.75 Weekend - per hour

Standby \$ 3.25 per hour

Franciscan Health Services

Nursing
 Shift Differential \$ 2.50 Evening - per hour
 \$ 4.00 Nights - per hour
 \$ 3.00 Weekends - per hour

Western State Hospital

Nursing
 Shift Differential \$ 1.50 per hour Evening and Nights
 Standby \$ 1.00 to \$3.00 per hour depending on base salary

Counselor
 Shift Differential \$.50 per hour Evenings and Nights

West Seattle Psych

Nursing
 Shift Differential \$ 1.00 Evening - per hour
 \$ 1.50 Night - per hour
 \$ 2.00 Weekend - per hour

Certification Pay Paid at next higher step based on experience and degree

Based upon these responses from the peer providers, we believe that the base salary figures in the Salary Survey are somewhat misleading in that many of the peer providers routinely pay “premiums” to staff that are not available to employees of Pierce County. To make a meaningful comparison of the salaries the shift differentials, certification pay, standby pay, etc. must be added to the base pay to complete the picture of the total compensation per hour.

We would also like to see the job descriptions of some of the peer groups’ position matches in order to compare required education and experience for the positions. We have some questions about the matches. For example, the Mental Health Evaluation Specialist is a job description that is written for and used for jail services. King County is the only one of the peer providers with a jail program, yet the survey shows 8 matches with 114 positions.

Appendix 2

Consultant Comments

May 9, 2006

The text of this report is the same as the draft report sent to Pierce County Human Services for review and comment, with the exception that tables 4, 5, and 6 were updated to reflect the latest available data. This appendix is additional information in response to Appendix 1.

The salary survey did not include “premium pay” as identified in Appendix 1 because the project had to be completed in six weeks by April 30, 2006. Facing this timeline to report back to the Pierce County Council, we decided that the survey data would be confined to base salaries (hourly pay rate) expressed as the minimum and maximum on the pay scales and average actual base salaries. The strategy was effective in that data was collected in the available time from all 13 surveyed organizations.

JM Management Consulting agrees with the comments in Appendix 1 that a total compensation survey would provide more comprehensive data, and we are willing to conduct such a survey if requested by Pierce County. Our approach would recognize two basic points.

1. A total compensation survey must gather comprehensive data.

Rather than just focus on “premium pay” in the sense of hiring bonuses, shift differentials, standby pay, certification pay, and preceptor pay, as suggested in the comments by Human Services, a total compensation survey would also have to gather data on supplemental pay (such as overtime and compensatory time), annual leave (such as vacation and sick leave), and insurance and retirement benefits. Given more time and resources, a comprehensive study could be done if there is a need to collect better market data.

2. Shift differentials in a labor contract are not the whole story, as one must also examine work schedules to see if shift differentials actually apply. It is also known that some other organizations besides Pierce County do not pay shift differentials.

For example, Kitsap Mental Health is the first organization cited in the response by Pierce County Human Services, and the reply indicates shift differentials for Nursing, Counselor, and CDMHP staff. Kitsap has five matches with the Pierce County classifications, but only two of them work swing, evening, or weekend shifts. Thus the scope of shift differentials is more limited than can be seen in the reply by Human Services. Other examples along these same lines are:

- ⇒ The “premium pay” discussed in Appendix 1 lists only six out of 13 survey sources.
- ⇒ St. Peter’s Hospital has shift differentials for “nursing,” as indicated by Human Services, but they apply only to RNs, not to Nurse Practitioners (ARNP) and LPNs.

⇒ Two of the three Pierce County “core service agencies,” Comprehensive Mental Health and Good Samaritan Behavioral Health, do not have shift differentials. Greater Lakes does have shift differentials in a limited number of positions. But none of the Greater Lakes matched classifications receives shift differential pay because none of them works evenings, nights, or on weekends.

In its response, Pierce County Human Services says (p. 14, second paragraph):

“In addition to the premium pay, the private providers and other E&Ts contacted do not have maximum salaries for **many** [emphasis added] of the professional classifications we surveyed.”

That is an exaggeration. As indicated in our report (page 12, Table 5, footnote c), “some” survey sources do not have maximum rates for “some” classifications. As shown below, only 15 out of 72 classification matches (21%) in the survey data have no maximum rates.

Pierce County Classification Title	Survey Matches	Matches With Maximum Rate	Matches With No Maximum Rate
Advanced Registered Nurse Practitioner (ARNP)	10	6	4
Behavior Health Specialist 3	8	6	2
Crisis Outreach MH Professional	5	4	1
Direct Service Supervisor	8	7	1
Licensed Practical Nurse (LPN)	10	9	1
MH Evaluation Specialist	8	6	2
MH Therapist	12	10	2
Registered Nurse (RN)	11	9	2
Total	72	57	15

Lastly, the report presented actual salaries in Table 6 (p. 13), where the Pierce County rates are generally higher. Thus it is clear that the lack of maximum rates in a few classifications in the survey data does not have a large impact on the general pattern of salary comparison results.