



**Pierce County**  
**LOWER PUYALLUP RIVER**  
**FLOOD PROTECTION INVESTIGATION**

---

Without-Project Analysis

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<i>Title</i>	<i>Page No.</i>
<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>ES-1</b>
Project Background and Purpose.....	ES-1
Study Area Description and History.....	ES-3
Hydrology.....	ES-3
Levees.....	ES-3
Geotechnical Characteristics.....	ES-3
Observed Physical Condition.....	ES-5
Stability and Seepage Analysis.....	ES-5
Probable Failure Point Analysis.....	ES-5
Erosion and Overtopping.....	ES-6
Sediment Deposition.....	ES-6
Hydraulics.....	ES-7
Economics.....	ES-9
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>1-1</b>
Puyallup River and Project Study Area Description.....	1-1
Lower Puyallup Study Area.....	1-1
Watershed.....	1-3
Dams.....	1-3
Flooding History.....	1-3
Channel Maintenance.....	1-4
Project Background.....	1-4
FEMA Guidelines for Levee Accreditation and Floodplain Mapping.....	1-4
Recent Floodplain Mapping for the Lower Puyallup River.....	1-5
Flood Protection Investigation Approach.....	1-5
Report Organization.....	1-6
<b>Chapter 2. Hydrology.....</b>	<b>2-1</b>
Available Flow Data.....	2-1
Effect of Dams on Hydrologic Analysis.....	2-7
Flood Frequency Analysis.....	2-8
Regulated Flows.....	2-8
Unregulated Flows.....	2-10
Composite Frequency Curves.....	2-10
Comparison with Flood Frequency Estimates from Previous Studies.....	2-14
Hydrograph Development.....	2-15

---

Historical Event Hydrographs.....	2-15
Climate Change.....	2-17
Composite Hydrograph.....	2-17
Flow Duration Curve.....	2-17
<b>Chapter 3. Preliminary Geotechnical Evaluation of Levees.....</b>	<b>3-1</b>
Levee History .....	3-1
Construction.....	3-1
Maintenance.....	3-2
Levee Description.....	3-2
Levee Types.....	3-2
Levee Elevations.....	3-4
Surface Features.....	3-4
Subsurface Characteristics .....	3-4
Existing Levee Condition .....	3-7
Analysis.....	3-9
Reach Delineation.....	3-9
Analysis Cross-Sections.....	3-9
Stability Analysis.....	3-10
Seepage Analysis .....	3-14
Probable Failure Point Analysis.....	3-16
Erosion.....	3-17
Overtopping .....	3-17
Conclusions .....	3-17
Potential Failure Modes .....	3-17
Data Gaps and Additional Studies .....	3-18
<b>Chapter 4. Sediment Transport and Deposition.....</b>	<b>4-1</b>
Introduction .....	4-1
Purpose.....	4-1
Prior Studies.....	4-1
Definitions .....	4-1
Existing Conditions .....	4-2
River Morphology.....	4-2
Surveyed Cross Sections.....	4-2
Bed Material .....	4-3
Observed Sediment Load.....	4-4
Stage-Discharge Rating Curve Shifts .....	4-5
Tidal Stage Characteristics .....	4-6
Description of Sediment Model.....	4-7
Model Assumptions .....	4-7
Model Limitations.....	4-8
Boundary Conditions .....	4-8
Model Adjustment and Verification .....	4-9
Hydraulic Model .....	4-9
Sedimentation Model.....	4-11
Model Application.....	4-13
Accumulated Load Curves.....	4-13
Effect of Sedimentation on Flood Levels .....	4-18
Summary of sedimentation modeling analysis.....	4-21

<b>Chapter 5. Hydraulic Analysis.....</b>	<b>5-1</b>
Model Development .....	5-1
River Channel and Levee Geometry .....	5-2
Floodplain Storage Areas.....	5-2
Hydraulic Structures—Bridges .....	5-2
Boundary Conditions .....	5-3
Initial Conditions .....	5-3
Model Calibration and Sensitivity Tests.....	5-4
Levee Overtopping Locations .....	5-4
Levee Breach Dimensions and Formation Parameters .....	5-7
Overtopping Flow Estimates .....	5-9
Flood Inundation Maps .....	5-16
Conclusion and Summary.....	5-16
<b>Chapter 6. Economic Analysis .....</b>	<b>6-1</b>
Methodology .....	6-1
Existing Floodplain Characteristics.....	6-3
Inventory of Study Area Structures .....	6-3
Structure Valuation for Study Area .....	6-3
Structures Inundated with Updated Floodplain .....	6-7
Estimated Damage Costs.....	6-14
Economic Uncertainty .....	6-14
Existing Conditions.....	6-14
Future Conditions .....	6-21
Average Annual Equivalent Damage.....	6-25
Effect of Levee Failure .....	6-29
Project Performance .....	6-33
<b>References.....</b>	<b>R-1</b>
<b>Appendices</b>	
A. Environmental Setting	
B. Puyallup River Cross-Sections	
C. Puyallup River Cross-Section Locations and Sediment Sampling Locations	
D. Sediment Sampling Laboratory Results	
E. Commencement Bay Transects	
F. HEC-RAS Model Cross-Section Information	
G. Economic Analysis Risk Inputs and Summary Results	

**LIST OF TABLES**

<i>No.</i>	<i>Title</i>	<i>Page No.</i>
ES-1	Total Peak Discharge Out of Lower Puyallup River Channel During Flood Events .....	ES-8
ES-2	Total Estimated Flood Damage Costs .....	ES-10
ES-3	50-Year Average Annual Equivalent Damage With and Without Levee Failure .....	ES-10
2-1	USGS Gage Data Available for Hydrologic Analysis .....	2-1
2-2	Generalized Pareto Distribution Parameters .....	2-9
2-3	Regulated Peak Flows at Puyallup .....	2-10
2-4	Generalized Extreme-Value Distribution Parameters .....	2-11
2-5	Unregulated Peak Flows at Puyallup .....	2-12
2-6	Summary of Frequency Analysis for the Lower Puyallup River .....	2-13
3-1	Levee Top Elevations and 100- and 500-Year Flood Elevations .....	3-5
3-2	Cross-Sections Analyzed as Typical .....	3-10
3-3	Corps Levee Stability Criteria for Existing Levees .....	3-10
3-4	Drawdown Rates at USGS Puyallup Gage (12101500) .....	3-11
3-5	Rapid Drawdown Analysis Results for Reach 1 .....	3-13
3-6	Rapid Drawdown Analysis Results for Reach 2 .....	3-13
3-7	Steady State Seepage Analyses Results .....	3-13
3-8	Identified Possibly More Critical Levee Cross-Sections .....	3-14
3-9	Seepage Analysis Results .....	3-16
4-1	Comparison of Measured Deposition to Simulated Deposition .....	4-12
4-2	Bed Elevation Change Summary .....	4-17
4-3	Predicted Flood Elevations at 2007, 2017 and 2057 Bed Levels .....	4-22
5-1	HEC-RAS Model Data Sources and Coordinate Systems .....	5-1
5-2	HEC-RAS Model Bridge Data Sources and Information .....	5-3
5-3	Levee Overtopping Locations .....	5-5
5-4	Levee overtopping Quantities with No Levee Breaches .....	5-6
5-5	Observed Levee Breach Widths on Large Rivers .....	5-8
5-6	Peak Discharge Over Levee or Through Breach, 2007 River Bed Level .....	5-10
5-7	Peak Discharge Over Levee or Through Breach, 2017 River Bed Level .....	5-11
5-8	Peak Discharge Over Levee or Through Breach, 2057 River Bed Level .....	5-12
5-9	Duration of Flow Over Levee or Through Breach, 2007 River Bed Level .....	5-13
5-10	Duration of Flow Over Levee or Through Breach, 2017 River Bed Level .....	5-14
5-11	Duration of Flow Over Levee or Through Breach, 2057 River Bed Level .....	5-15
5-12	Floodplain Inundation Mapping Scenarios .....	5-16
6-1	Number of Right-Bank Structures Inundated, by Event and Category; Existing Conditions .....	6-8
6-2	Number of Left-Bank Structures Inundated, by Event and Category; Existing Conditions .....	6-8
6-3	Depreciated Replacement Value of Inundated Right-Bank Structures, by Event and Category; Existing Conditions .....	6-10
6-4	Depreciated Replacement Value of Inundated Left-Bank Structures, by Event and Category; Existing Conditions .....	6-10
6-5	Value of Contents in Inundated Right-Bank Structures, by Event and Category; Existing Conditions .....	6-12
6-6	Value of Contents in Inundated Left-Bank Structures, by Event and Category;	

Existing Conditions.....	6-12
6-7 Right-Bank Structure and Content Damage Costs by Flood Event; Existing Conditions .....	6-15
6-8 Left-Bank Structure and Content Damage Costs by Flood Event; Existing Conditions.....	6-15
6-9 Total Right-Bank Damage Cost by Flood Event; Existing Conditions.....	6-19
6-10 Total Left-Bank Damage Cost by Flood Event; Existing Conditions.....	6-19
6-11 Number of Right-Bank Structures Inundated, by Event and Category; Existing and Future Conditions .....	6-21
6-12 Number of Left-Bank Structures Inundated, by Event and Category; Existing and Future Conditions.....	6-21
6-13 Total Right-Bank Damage Costs by Event and Category; Existing and Future Conditions.....	6-23
6-14 Total Left-Bank Damage Costs by Event and Category; Existing and Future Conditions .....	6-23
6-15 Average Annual Equivalent Damage.....	6-25
6-16 Existing and Future Right-Bank Expected Annual Damage and 50-Year Average Annual Equivalent Damage .....	6-27
6-17 Existing and Future Left-Bank Expected Annual Damage and 50-Year Average Annual Equivalent Damage .....	6-27
6-18 Existing and Future Right-Bank Expected Annual Damage and 50-Year Average Annual Equivalent Damage; Levee Overtopping Only .....	6-31
6-19 Existing and Future Left-Bank Expected Annual Damage and 50-Year Average Annual Equivalent Damage; Levee Overtopping Only .....	6-31
6-20 Annual Exceedance Probability and Long-Term Risk.....	6-34
6-21 Conditional Non-Exceedance Probability.....	6-34

## LIST OF FIGURES

<i>No.</i>	<i>Title</i>	<i>Page No.</i>
ES-1	Study Area for the Without-Project Analysis .....	ES-2
ES-2	Peak Flows Estimated in Without-Project Analysis.....	ES-4
ES-3	Design Hydrographs for the 2- through 500-Year Flood Events .....	ES-4
ES-4	Sediment Rating Curve for Puyallup River at Puyallup Gage (12101500), 1978—1994.....	ES-6
ES-5	Predicted Levee Overtopping Locations.....	ES-7
ES-6	Predicted Flooding for 2007 River Bed Levels with No Levee Breach.....	ES-9
1-1	Study Area.....	1-2
1-2	Puyallup River Watershed.....	<i>after</i> 1-4
1-3	100-Year Floodplain Mapped by FEMA, 1987 .....	<i>after</i> 1-6
1-4	100-Year Floodplain Mapped by FEMA, 2007 .....	<i>after</i> 1-6
2-1	Flow Records from WY 1915 to WY 1924 .....	2-2
2-2	Flow Records from WY 1925 to WY 1934 .....	2-2
2-3	Flow Records from WY 1935 to WY 1944 .....	2-3
2-4	Flow Records from WY 1945 to WY 1954 .....	2-3
2-5	Flow Records from WY 1955 to WY 1964 .....	2-4
2-6	Flow Records from WY 1965 to WY 1974 .....	2-4
2-7	Flow Records from WY 1975 to WY 1984 .....	2-5
2-8	Flow Records from WY 1985 to WY 1994 .....	2-5

2-9	Flow Records from WY 1995 to WY 2004 .....	2-6
2-10	Flow Records from WY 2005 to WY 2007 .....	2-6
2-11	Regulated Flood Frequency Curves .....	2-9
2-12	1-Day vs. Peak Annual Discharge at Puyallup (Station 12101500).....	2-11
2-13	Unregulated Flood Frequency Curves.....	2-12
2-14	Regulated, Unregulated and Composite Flood Frequency Curves .....	2-13
2-15	November 1986 Storm Hydrograph.....	2-15
2-16	January 1990 Storm Hydrograph .....	2-16
2-17	February 1996 Storm Hydrograph .....	2-16
2-18	Design Hydrographs for the 2- through 500-Year Flood Events.....	2-17
2-19	Flow Duration Curve for Puyallup River from WY 1945 to WY 2006.....	2-18
3-1	Lower Puyallup Flood Protection History (4 Sheets) .....	<i>inside back of report</i>
3-2	Existing River Bed, Levee Top and Water Surface Profiles.....	<i>after 3-4</i>
3-3	Silt Bench Repair Area on Right Bank near RM 5.6 .....	3-8
4-1	Bed Material Characteristics for Lower 6.87 Miles of Study Reach .....	4-3
4-2	Bed Material Characteristics for Upper 3.32 Miles of Study Reach.....	4-4
4-3	Sediment Rating Curve for Puyallup River at Puyallup Gage (12101500), 1978—1994.....	4-4
4-4	Stage-Discharge Curve for Puyallup River at Puyallup Gage (12101500).....	4-5
4-5	Gage Height Shift for Puyallup River at Puyallup Gage (12101500).....	4-6
4-6	Comparison of Adjusted Geometry to Original Geometry for 10-Year Flood .....	4-10
4-7	Comparison of Adjusted Geometry to Original Geometry for 50-Year Flood .....	4-10
4-8	Comparison of Adjusted Geometry to Original Geometry for 100-Year Flood .....	4-11
4-9	Sediment Inflow Rating Curve With USGS Suspended Sediment Data.....	4-12
4-10	Comparison of Measured Deposition to Modeled Deposition.....	4-13
4-11	Total Accumulated Load Over 10 Years of Simulation.....	4-14
4-12	Total Accumulated Load Over 20 Years of Simulation.....	4-15
4-13	Total Accumulated Load Over 30 Years of Simulation.....	4-15
4-14	Total Accumulated Load Over 40 Years of Simulation.....	4-16
4-15	Total Accumulated Load Over 50 Years of Simulation.....	4-16
4-16	Specific Gage Analysis at River Mile 1.4719 .....	4-18
4-17	Specific Gage Analysis at River Mile 2.322 .....	4-19
4-18	Specific Gage Analysis at River Mile 5.7554 .....	4-19
4-19	Specific Gage Analysis at River Mile 6.5693 .....	4-20
4-20	Specific Gage Analysis at River Mile 8.669 .....	4-20
5-1	HEC-RAS Model Floodplain Storage Areas .....	<i>after 5-2</i>
5-2	HEC-RAS Model Levee Overtopping Segments.....	<i>after 5-4</i>
5-3	Example Embankment Overtopping in Early Stages of a Breach (Temple et. al., 2006).....	5-7
5-4	Floodplain Inundation Area for 2-, 10-, 25-, 50-, 100- and 500-Year Events, 2007 River Bed Level, No Levee Breach .....	<i>after 5-16</i>
5-5	Floodplain Inundation Area for 10-, 25-, 50-, 100- and 500-Year Events, 2007 River Bed Level, Right Levee PNP-Triggered Breach .....	<i>after 5-16</i>
5-6	Floodplain Inundation Area for 500-Year Event, 2007 River Bed Level, Right Levee PFP-Triggered Breach.....	<i>after 5-16</i>
5-7	Floodplain Inundation Area for 100- and 500-Year Events, 2017 River Bed Level, No Levee Breach .....	<i>after 5-16</i>
5-8	Floodplain Inundation Area for 10-, 25-, 50-, 100- and 500-Year Events, 2017 River Bed Level, Right Levee PNP-Triggered Breach .....	<i>after 5-16</i>
5-9	Floodplain Inundation Area for 50-, 100- and 500-Year Events,	

2017 River Bed Level, Right Levee PFP-Triggered Breach..... after 5-16

5-10 Floodplain Inundation Area for 100- and 500-Year Events,  
2057 River Bed Level, No Levee Breach ..... after 5-16

5-11 Floodplain Inundation Area for 10-, 25-, 50-, 100- and 500-Year Events,  
2057 River Bed Level, Right Levee PNP-Triggered Breach ..... after 5-16

5-12 Floodplain Inundation Area for 50-, 100- and 500-Year Events,  
2057 River Bed Level, Right Levee PFP-Triggered Breach..... after 5-16

  

6-1 Structures in Study Area ..... 6-4

6-2 Classification of Non-Residential Structures in Study Area ..... 6-4

6-3 Residential Structures Sampled..... 6-5

6-4 Designated Farm Land ..... 6-5

6-5 Estimated Depreciated Replacement Value of All Structures in Study Area Database ..... 6-6

6-6 Updated Without-Project Floodplains with Right-Bank Levee Breach ..... 6-7

6-7 Number of Right-Bank Structures Inundated; Existing Conditions ..... 6-9

6-8 Number of Left-Bank Structures Inundated; Existing Conditions ..... 6-9

6-9 Depreciated Replacement Value of Inundated Right-Bank Structures; Existing Conditions ..... 6-11

6-10 Depreciated Replacement Value of Inundated Left-Bank Structures; Existing Conditions ..... 6-11

6-11 Value of Content in Inundated Right-Bank Structures; Existing Conditions..... 6-13

6-12 Value of Content in Inundated Left-Bank Structures; Existing Conditions..... 6-13

6-13 Right-Bank Structure and Content Damage Costs; Existing Conditions ..... 6-16

6-14 Left-Bank Structure and Content Damage Costs; Existing Conditions ..... 6-16

6-15 Inundation of I-5 by 500-Year Flood Event..... 6-17

6-16 Inundation of Union Pacific Railroad by 500-Year Flood Event..... 6-18

6-17 Total Right-Bank Damage Cost; Existing Conditions ..... 6-20

6-18 Total Left-Bank Damage Cost; Existing Conditions ..... 6-20

6-19 Number of Right-Bank Structures Inundated; Existing and Future Conditions..... 6-22

6-20 Number of Left-Bank Structures Inundated; Existing and Future Conditions..... 6-22

6-21 Right-Bank Damage Costs; Existing and Future Conditions ..... 6-24

6-22 Left-Bank Damage Costs; Existing and Future Conditions ..... 6-24

6-23 Uncertainty in Discharge, Stage and Damage in Determining Expected Annual Damage..... 6-25

6-24 Average Annual Equivalent Damage Costs ..... 6-26

6-25 Existing and Future Right-Bank EAD and 50-Year AAED..... 6-28

6-26 Existing and Future Left-Bank EAD and 50-Year AAED..... 6-28

6-27 100-Year Floodplain with Levee Breach and with Levee Overtopping Only..... 6-29

6-28 500-Year Floodplain with Levee Breach and with Levee Overtopping Only..... 6-30

6-29 Existing and Future Conditions 100-Year Floodplain with Levee Overtopping Only ..... 6-30

6-30 Existing and Future Right-Bank EAD and 50-Year AAED, Levee Overtopping Only..... 6-32

6-31 Existing and Future Left-Bank EAD and 50-Year AAED, Levee Overtopping Only..... 6-32